

NARRATIVE/SYSTEMATIC REVIEWS/META-ANALYSIS

Telemedicine: Bridging the Gap in Providing Primary Care to Rural Area Patients Across India

Aswini Ashokan Naidu, MD

M-Swasth Solutions Private Limited, Gurgaon, India

Corresponding Author: Dr. Aswini Ashokan Naidu; Email: aswini.naidu@m-insure.in

DOI: https://doi.org/10.30953/thmt.v9.518

Keywords: data protection, digital health, digital infrastructure, legislation, primary care, rural healthcare, telemedicine

Abstract

Telemedicine has emerged as a transformative solution to address the significant healthcare disparities faced by rural India, where over 70% of the population resides. In this article, the evolution of telemedicine in India, its current landscape, and its potential to revolutionize primary healthcare delivery in rural areas are reviewed. Despite progress in establishing Primary Health Centers, rural healthcare infrastructure remains underutilized due to staffing shortages and other challenges. Telemedicine offers a lifeline by bridging critical gaps in primary care, with government initiatives such as E-Sanjeevni and private entities such as M-Swasth and Apollo TeleHealth expanding access to healthcare services.

The COVID-19 pandemic accelerated the adoption of more advanced, patient-centric telemedicine models incorporating artificial intelligence, machine learning, and Internet of Things technologies. These innovations aim to provide rural communities with healthcare standards comparable to urban areas. However, challenges persist, including technological barriers, digital literacy gaps, and concerns about data security and privacy. To fully realize telemedicine's potential, a multifaceted approach is necessary. This includes culturally adapting platforms for rural populations, strengthening data protection legislation, enhancing digital infrastructure, and increasing digital literacy. The collaborative efforts of government bodies, private enterprises, healthcare professionals, and non-profit private organizations are crucial in overcoming these challenges. By embracing telemedicine and addressing its implementation barriers, India can bridge the healthcare gap, improve the quality of life for millions of rural residents, and potentially catalyze economic development in rural areas.

Plain Language Summary

Telemedicine is revolutionizing healthcare in rural India, where over 70% of the population resides. This technology applies digital tools to connect patients with doctors remotely, addressing the shortage of healthcare services in rural areas. The COVID-19 pandemic accelerated telemedicine adoption, with government and private initiatives expanding access to primary care. Advanced technologies such as artificial intelligence are enhancing these services. However, challenges remain, including digital literacy gaps and data security concerns. We must adapt platforms culturally, strengthen data protection, improve digital infrastructure, and increase digital literacy to realize the potential of telemedicine fully. Successful implementation of telemedicine can significantly improve healthcare access and quality of life for millions of rural Indians.

Received: August 8, 2024; Accepted: September 12, 2024; Published: October 31, 2024

he rural population of India, which comprises more than 70% of the total population, has historically encountered substantial inequalities in terms of accessing healthcare. Rural areas, which account for 46% of the national income and employ 68% of the workforce, struggle to get adequate healthcare infrastructure,

trained medical professionals, and access to essential medical facilities.² Under such circumstances, telemedicine—which makes use of information and communication technologies—can be a catalyst for providing rural Indian communities with easily available, high-quality healthcare to improve social, physical, and psychological well-being.

(page number not for citation purpose)

Telehealth and Medicine Today © 2024, 9:518

Telemedicine is more than a tool for patient care. It is a solution that bridges the primary care gap in rural India. By enabling remote consultations and continuous monitoring, telemedicine ensures that essential healthcare services reach even the most isolated communities, where traditional healthcare infrastructure is often lacking. While telemedicine is bridging physical distances and revolutionizing primary healthcare delivery, its scalability and sustainability are often hampered by systemic barriers, particularly in rural communities. If the inadequacies and gaps are not solved promptly, this can further raise a question of telemedicine's effectiveness in reducing existing rural and urban disparities.

In this article, the author examines the current landscape of telemedicine in India, its role in transforming rural primary healthcare, the collaborative efforts required, and the actions that might help to overcome the barriers to ensuring telemedicine's effectiveness.

The Evolution of Telemedicine

Telemedicine has a long history dating back to ancient civilizations. Around 500 BCE, Greeks, Romans, and Native American tribes used smoke signals, fires, pigeons, drums, and light reflection to communicate health events and medical emergencies, marking the earliest instances of remote medicine.⁴ However, it was not until the invention of the electrical telegraph, telephone, and, later, the internet and video communication technologies that modern telemedicine began to take shape.⁵

In India, telemedicine's growth has accelerated in recent years, driven by technological advancements and rising demand for healthcare services in underserved regions. The Government of India (GOI) recognized telemedicine's potential and implemented policies to support its expansion. According to recent projections, India's telemedicine market is expected to grow at a compound annual growth rate of 21.2% from 2022 to 2030, reaching \$5.15 billion by 2030.6 This growth presents a significant opportunity to address the healthcare challenges faced by rural communities.

Health Practices and Current Scenario of Primary Healthcare in Rural India

Rural populations suffer the worst impact of socioeconomic, cultural, and political onslaughts, enduring the most hazardous working conditions and miserable living conditions. Most of the population comprises farmers, laborers, artisans, and smallholders with limited financial resources for essential needs.⁷ These factors present difficulties for the public health system, such as unsanitary childbirth practices, contaminated water, inadequate nutrition, and deteriorated environments. A subset of India's rural population adheres to unique health beliefs and practices, often resorting to undocumented medical

systems, such as magico-religious rituals, to seek remedies. Hence, it is imperative to examine the inherent characteristics of rural health problems in order to improve the overall well-being of the rural environment.

Patil and colleagues report that rural regions experience double the disease incidence of urban areas, with limited primary healthcare access for rural residents due to systems favoring wealthier populations.7 According to the authors, regional disparities, service quality, staff adequacy and motivation, and supply shortages in the Primary Health Centers (PHC) system have severely underutilized the infrastructure. The GOI's Rural Health Statistics 2020-2021 report bolsters Patil and colleagues' study by highlighting both progress and persistent challenges. As of March 31, 2021, 25,140 PHCs are functioning in rural areas, marking an increase of 1,904 PHCs since 2005, an 8.2% growth. Despite this increase, the average rural population covered by a PHC is 35,602, significantly exceeding the recommended norm of 20,000 to 30,000. In addition, 90.3% of these PHCs operate in government buildings, a notable improvement from 69% in 2005. However, there are still substantial vacancies and shortfalls in staffing. For instance, there is a deficit of 4.3% in allopathic doctors at PHCs, with 21.8% of sanctioned doctor positions remaining vacant. Furthermore, at PHCs, there is a significant shortfall of 72.2% in the number of health (male and female) assistants (Table 1).

Given the significant underutilization of healthcare infrastructure in rural areas, telemedicine offers a life-line by filling critical gaps in primary care. Government entities like E-Sanjeevni are consistently partnering with local PHCs and hospitals to extend their reach, ensuring that even basic primary care services such as vaccinations,

Table 1. Status of primary health centers in India as of March 31, 2021

Current status of PHCs	n (%)
Functioning PHCs in rural areas	 25,140 as of 3/31/24 1,904 increase since 2005 (8.2% growth).
PHCs operating in government buildings Challenges for PHCs	90.3%Increase from 69% since 2005
Average rural population covered by a PHC	35,602Recommended norm is 20,000 to 30,000.
PHCs operating in government buildings	90.3%Improved from 69% in 2005
Deficit in allopathic physicians in practice at PHCs	4.3%21.8% of sanctioned doctor positions are vacant
Health assistants (male and female)	• 72.2% shortfall

PHC: primary health centers.

Table 2. Indian government (departments and legislation) and private entities addressing the challenges in creating a digital health ecosystem for the country

Entity	Goal
Indian Public Health Standards (IPHS) 2022	Strengthen the rural public health system
Ayushman Bharat Digital Mission (ABDM)	Develop the foundation and implement the integrated digital health infrastructure of India
Account Aggregators (AA)	 Consolidate data from multiple sources, simplifying financial management with user con- sent-based data sharing
eSanjeevani	The National Telemedicine Service of MoHFW, GOICharged with health policy in India
National Health Policy	 Outline a robust framework to achieve health for all through adoption of basic principles of accessibility, quality and affordability, leveraging the power of ICTs to strengthen the healthcare delivery system
National Health Authority (NHA)	 NHA is an agency of the GOI NHA is charged with implementing India's flagship public health insurance/assurance scheme
Digital Health Incentive Scheme (DHIS)	 For the stakeholders of the digital health ecosystem, this scheme aims to boost digital health transactions under the ABDM
Telemedicine Society of India (TSI)	 Leverage affordance of Al-driven, state-of-the-art and Cyber Physical Systems to meet current and emerging needs of all healthcare stakeholders.
M-SWASTH	 Digital Healthcare Services provider, operating remote clinics in rural areas through their tele- health and telemedicine platform
Apollo TeleHealth	• Deliver the benefits of ICT and biomedical technology to underserved communities through its comprehensive e-Health solution.
Digital Personal Data Protection Act, 2023 (DPDPA)	 An act of the Parliament of India providing for processing digital personal data and right of individu- als to protect their personal data while processing data for lawful purposes and related matters.
eSanjeevani	National Telemedicine Service of India

AA: Account Aggregators; ABDM: Ayushman Bharat Digital Mission; AI: artificial Intelligence; GOI: Government of India; ICTs: information and communication technologies; MoHFW: Ministry of Health and Family Welfare.

chronic disease management, and antenatal care are accessible to rural populations.

A study reported by Parthasarathi and colleagues in 2024 discusses the lack of research on telemedicine's cost-effectiveness, communication among providers, and the role of leadership in its quality and accessibility.³ They concluded that a multifaceted approach is necessary to implement telemedicine across diverse conditions and regions effectively. The success of healthcare transformation relies on the collaborative efforts of clinicians and policymakers to adapt, enhance infrastructure, improve digital literacy, and implement evidence-based policies.

Telemedicine Role in Rural India

Can telemedicine truly match the depth and precision of traditional face-to-face consultations, especially in complex medical cases? This is the critical question that looms large as we stand at the brink of a healthcare revolution. There is debate about whether remote consultations can replace the nuanced understanding and diagnosis that occur in person, particularly for chronic or complex conditions.

As the government understands the role of public health in the growing economy, leaders and administrators are on a mission to create a digital health ecosystem for the country. The GOI has laid down Indian

Public Health Standards (IPHS) 2022, Ayushman Bharat Digital Mission (ABDM), Account Aggregator (AA) framework, National Digital Health Mission (NDHM), National Digital Health Blueprint (NDHB), National Health Authority (NHA), Digital Health Incentive Scheme, Telemedicine Society of India (TSI), and comprehensive telemedicine guidelines to improve the telemedicine practice and overall healthcare in India (Table 2). However, reaching remote areas and providing healthcare to last-mile citizens through conventional methods remains a challenge. To address this gap, there are new initiatives and investments from both the GOI and private entities (including social enterprises, public-private partnerships, and corporate social responsibility) to improve affordability and healthcare access. As a result, comprehensive e-clinics equipped with advanced information and communication technology (ICT) are being set up in increasing numbers in rural areas with certifications from various government departments. These initiatives also include schemes that provide incentives for private entities to integrate their electronic medical records with the Health Registry, enhancing its utility for public health initiatives.

The e-clinics are proving instrumental in delivering telemedicine services to rural areas—revolutionizing access to primary care. Complementing government initiatives

Table 3. Telemedicine initiatives that address an array of diseases and health conditions

Initiative	Activity
Non-Communicable Diseases	Screen and manage conditions (i.e., hypertension, diabetes, cardiovascular diseases)
Mental Health Ailments	Screening and manage mental health issues
Ophthalmic and ENT Problems	 Care for common eye and ear, nose, and throat issues
Basic Dental Health Care	Provide primary dental care services
Geriatric and Palliative Health Care	 Service the elderly and those needing palliative care
Basic Trauma and Emergency Care	 Initial management and stabilization of trauma
Maternal and Child Health	 Address reproductive and child health, including prenatal and postnatal care
Communicable Diseases	 Diagnosis, treat, and prevention of major infectious diseases

ENT: ear, nose, and throat.

like E-Sanjeevni, private entities such as M-Swasth and Apollo TeleHealth are also at the forefront of this transformation. E-Sanjeevni has already made a significant impact, serving over 277 million patients through a vast network of 127,499 Health and Wellness Centers, supported by 16,211 hubs and more than 477 online outpatient departments.⁹ On the other hand, M-Swasth has successfully served over 5 million patients, demonstrating the critical role of stand-alone private organizations. This extensive reach is made possible by over 0.2 million telemedicine practitioners, including doctors, medical specialists, and health workers.

Various telemedicine studies report success in improving primary care outcomes in rural India, particularly in child and women's health, diabetes, psychiatric conditions, and infectious diseases.³ Telemedicine initiatives focus on patient education, behavior change, point-of-care diagnostics, and tele-follow-ups. It addresses a diverse array of diseases and health conditions (Table 3).

Need for an Updated Telemedicine Model

Prior to 2020, e-clinics relied predominantly on rudimentary telecommunication tools and offered limited services. These clinics faced technological challenges (internet connectivity and gaps in digital literacy), cost limitations, accessibility problems, social acceptability issues, and sustainability and scalability concerns. ^{10,11} The primary objective was to provide prompt medical consultations.

Despite these barriers, the initial efforts established the foundation for more advanced and expandable business models. Since the COVID-19 pandemic, the telemedicine business model has evolved to become more holistic and patient-centric. Organizations have begun integrating advanced digital health technologies, such as AI, machine learning, and the Internet of Things, in e-clinics to provide tailored and timely healthcare solutions. In addition to improved patient outcomes, it will ensure that rural communities receive the same standard of primary care as their urban counterparts.

As telemedicine rapidly becomes the norm, we must ask: Are these new business models sufficiently robust to truly safeguard patient privacy, and how effectively do they manage the delicate task of handling sensitive health data? The swift rise of telemedicine brings to light pressing concerns about data security, particularly in rural areas where the understanding and enforcement of data protection laws may be worryingly inadequate.

Future Challenges

The transformative potential of telemedicine in bridging the healthcare gap in rural India is undeniable. However, uncovering its full potential requires the concerted efforts of various stakeholders, including government entities, private enterprises, healthcare professionals, and non-profit private organizations. As mentioned earlier, the GOI has already laid the groundwork with supportive policies and initiatives. However, further action is needed to ensure these policies translate into tangible benefits for rural populations.

To culturally adapt telemedicine platforms for rural Indian populations, incorporating local languages and providing interpreter services is crucial for effective communication. Engaging with community leaders and offering educational outreach can build trust and promote the acceptance of telemedicine services. Platforms could be designed to support and empower local community health workers, such as Accredited Social Health Activists, Auxiliary Nursing and Midwifery, and General Nursing and Midwifery.

In addition, telemedicine platforms should be optimized for low-bandwidth environments and offer offline capabilities to account for potential network issues common in rural areas. This can be achieved by using low-bandwidth tablets during consultations in areas with limited network infrastructure, ensuring minimal disruption in patient care. Additionally, affordability can be maintained by tailoring service fees to match the socio-economic status of rural populations while still delivering high-quality consultations.

Protecting data security and privacy in telemedicine should be a top priority. Current legislation, such as India's Information Technology Act and Data Protection Rules, must be updated to include specific standards for telemedicine to ensure the confidentiality of health-related information.3 Establishing the National Digital Health Authority and implementing the Digital Personal Data Protection Act of 2023 are crucial steps toward enhancing digital health governance. These initiatives should be further developed to create a robust data governance framework that emphasizes accountability and protects personal data in the healthcare sector.

Finally, to address the digital divide in telemedicine adoption, efforts must focus on enhancing infrastructure and increasing digital literacy in rural areas.¹² This includes improving internet connectivity and building local facilities equipped with telemedicine services, reducing the reliance on individual devices. Furthermore, ongoing digital literacy programs are essential to overcome technological anxiety and empower rural populations to use telemedicine effectively.

Conclusion

The path to a healthier and more equitable India lies in the successful implementation of telemedicine; it is the collective responsibility of every stakeholder. By doing so, we can ensure that every individual, regardless of their geographical location, has access to the healthcare they need and deserve. Moreover, telemedicine can catalyze economic development in rural areas. Chronic diseases can be managed more effectively with continuous remote monitoring, reducing the need for frequent hospital visits.

Let us embrace this opportunity to bridge the healthcare gap and improve the quality of life for millions of rural Indians. The future of healthcare is here, and it is digital, ensuring inclusivity, efficiency, and accessibility, as well as safe, affordable, and timely health management.

Funding

No funding was provided for the preparation of this editorial.

Financial and Non-Financial Relationships and **Activities**

No relevant disclosures.

Contributors

The author is responsible for the conception through the authoring of this editorial.

Data Availability Statement (DAS), Data Sharing, Reproducibility, and Data Repositories

Data used in the writing of this article are published in the public domain.

Application of Al-Generated Text or Related Technology

No AI tools were used in developing this manuscript.

References

- 1. Bagchi S. Telemedicine in rural India. PLoS Med. 2006;3(3):e82. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.0030082
- 2. Home. NITI Aayog [Internet]. [cited 2024 Aug 6]. Available from: https://www.niti.gov.in/
- 3. Parthasarathi A, George T, Kalimuth MB, Jayasimha S, Ullah MK, Patil R, et al. Exploring the potential of telemedicine for improved primary healthcare in India: a comprehensive review. Lancet Reg Health Southeast Asia. 2024;27:100431. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.lansea.2024.100431
- 4. Kumar S, White J, II, Baum N. Becoming a certified telemedicine professional: here's how to take telemedicine to the next level. Podiatr Manage. 2021;40(6):151-6.
- 5. Jagarapu J, Savani RC. A brief history of telemedicine and the evolution of teleneonatology. Semin Perinatol. 2021;45(5):151416. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.semperi.2021.151416
- 6. Shah N. Insights10 [Internet]. [cited 2024 Aug 6]. Available from: https://www.insights10.com/report/india-telemedicinemarket-analysis/
- 7. Patil AV, Somasundaram KV, Goyal RC. Current health scenario in rural India. Aust J Rural Health. 2002;10(2):129-35. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1440-1584.2002.tb00022.x
- 8. Reports. GOI [Internet]. [cited 2024 Aug 6]. Available from: https://mohfw.gov.in/?q=documents/reports
- 9. Ministry of Health and Family Welfare Govt of India [Internet]. [cited 2024 Aug 6]. Available from: https://esanjeevani.mohfw. gov.in/#/about.eSanjeevani - National Telemedicine Service
- 10. Alenoghena CO, Ohize HO, Adejo AO, Onumanyi AJ, Ohihoin EE, Balarabe AI, et al. Telemedicine: a survey of telecommunication technologies, developments, and challenges. J Sens Actuator Netw. 2023;12(2):20. https://doi.org/10.3390/jsan12020020
- 11. Bahrani K, Singh MB, Bhatia R, Prasad K, Vibha D, Shukla G. Telephonic review for outpatients with epilepsy—a prospective randomized, parallel-group study. Seizure. 2017;53:55-61. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seizure.2017.11.003
- 12. Lestari HM, Miranda AV, Fuady A. Barriers to telemedicine adoption among rural communities in developing countries: a systematic review and proposed framework. Clin Epidemiol Glob Health. 2024;28:101684. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cegh.2024.101684

Copyright Ownership: This is an open-access article/editorial distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, adapt, enhance this work non-commercially, and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited, and the use is non-commercial. See http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0.